TANJUNGPURA INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL ON DYNAMICS ECONOMIC, SOCIAL SCIENCES AND AGRIBUSINESS

http://tijdessa.untan.ac.id/

THE EFFECTIVENESS OF APPLICATION OF LAICITE IN SECULARISM LIFE IN FRANCE TO MINIMIZE RELIGIOUS RADICALIZATION GROUPS

Rezky Apriliantini[1], Visa Juliansyah[2], dan **Rachma Putri[3]**

[1] [2] [3]Universitas Tanjugpura

Abstract: This paper aims to explain how the effectiveness of the application of Laicite in the life of secularism in France in minimizing religious radicalization groups in that country. The author team uses Constructivism theory and uses the concept of Human Security. The author's team used a descriptive research method with a qualitative approach. Data collection techniques used are literature study in the form of books, literature, previous research journals, and from news websites. The results of the research in this paper indicate that there is an effective role in the application of Laicite in the life of secularism in France in minimizing religious radical groups in the country. Through constitutional authority in the form of the Laicite Law, it can strengthen the existence of laws which must be understood that France separates religious affairs and state government affairs.

Keywords: *Laicite, Separatism, Secularism, France.*

Introduction

France is one of the countries in the international world known as a secularist country. This French country has a fairly complex past, starting from the process of its government system which was still a monarchy until it turned into a semi-presidential republican government as it is today. The French state has a unique side to its past story which until now is closely related to the problems of separatism issues that have arisen in France, such as the emergence of radical groups that move in the name of a certain religion as an expressive form of disagreeing with the concept of secularism applied by France.

Basically, the thing that underlies the issue of separatism in France stems from a major conflict, which occurred in the act of war between Catholics and Protestants in France during the government era which still applied the concept of monarchy. This conflict is influenced by the aristocracy which has the understanding that a concept of power will only be owned by certain groups that are privileged. This happened at the level of the ruler's lineage involving the Bourbon dynasty who supported Protestant Christian religious groups and the Guise dynasty which supported Catholic Christian religious groups that occurred in 1562 to 1598. Then this was also related to the moment of the Vassy massacre or also known as ' Wassy' as the beginning of the religious war in France whose victims reached up to 2-4 million people. The massacre involving two religious groups became so large that it became known as the second deadliest religious war in European history.

After the period of heavy war between these two religious groups, it began to end with the presence of a group consisting of intellectuals to resolve the issue of civil war between the two religions that share the same God. Then, in this case it is called the Renaissance period which means the century of renewal in Europe during the 14th to 17th centuries by bringing the concept of humanism.

The Renaissance era was also interpreted as a time when the concept of independent, critical thinking with a humanistic approach and a picture related to future political law (Shaw, 2008). The concept of humanism is spread with the meaning to put forward the value and position of humans in the life of French society. This is because, it was also influenced by the dark times during religious wars which also caused many cases of corruption in churches in Europe, including France. This then continued in the peace effort between the two Catholic and Protestant Christian religious groups which was carried out in 1598 through the Declaration of Nantes which continued in the Peace of Alais in 1629.

In the Renaissance era, this continued in 1789 in this case a major phenomenon occurred, namely the French Revolution known as the concept of Liberte, Egalite and Fraterrite (Freedom, Equality and Brotherhood). At this time, against the backdrop of the leadership of King Louis XVI (1774-1789), France was experiencing a period of decline due to the economic crisis and the chaotic system under the leadership of King Louis XVI. After going through tough times with the end of the reign of King Louis XVI which was also accompanied by the success of the French revolution, starting during the reign of the French Directorate to replace the previous government by making a separation between religion and state. This was done through the constitution in 1795, namely by secularizing institutions starting from the institutions of marriage, health, education and then proceeding with the gradual separation of other institutions.

In the French constitution in 1958, it was stated that the affirmation of the concept of secularism that was applied, namely precisely in paragraph 2 "France is indivisible, secular (Laique), democratic and a social republic. And, this can guarantee equality for all citizens before the law without distinction origin, race and religion. And all beliefs are respected" (Modood and Kastoryana, 2006). In Europe, secularism also means freedom from religion, which means that every activity in the state and its government will not involve any religion.

Secularism in France is also known as Laicite which is commonly attached to the Declaration of Population Rights (Lefebvre, 2005). So, until now this concept has become a basic pillar of France, namely as part of strengthening for freedom of opinion, freedom of expression (Law, 1881), and in this case freedom of the media to draw including cartoons (UU, 1958). However, as time goes by, the presence of the concept of secularism is increasingly being opposed by religious groups, especially those born of Islamism, namely Al-Qaeda, ISIS, and others as well as from other religious groups who feel that this is contrary to their religious beliefs. considered as an insult. So that separatist groups appear on behalf of their beliefs and religions that need to be protected, respected and others.

With the reality of the issue of various kinds of separatist group movements in France as a country with the concept of secularism (Laicite), then comes the Clash of Civilization or known as the clash of civilizations due to the many sources of conflict that come from human cultural and religious identity. Starting from the emergence of the satirical magazine Charlie Hebdo which also resulted in the emergence of cases of separatism in the name of Islam in France, such as the beheading case, the Samuel Paty terror which subsequently caused President Emmanuel Macron to state that Islam is in a crisis period asking whether this Islamic group is too fanatical so that commit acts of terrorism. Thus, Macron's statement makes more and more actions from radical groups, such as the terrorist act in one of the French churches which killed 3 civilians after the Samuel Paty case.

This has an impact on Macron's attitude in investigating 50 Islamic communities or groups in France, such as the Collective Against Islamophobia In France (CCIF), Barakacity. The truth about CCIF emerged from its criticism of the French government for carrying out Islamophobic actions. Until finally, in October 2020 Macron took the decision to overcome the issue of separatism in France, by establishing a separatism law in France because so far there has been no law that regulates to impose sanctions for anyone who violates the concept of Laicite (secularism) in France. Therefore, this scientific writing aims to find out the reasons why the concept of Laicite has been opposed by separatist groups in France and to find out the process of applying Laicite in the life of secularism in France. This scientific writing will determine two focus issues to be discussed, namely, firstly an explanation regarding why the concept of Laicite has been opposed by separatist groups in France, and secondly, an explanation of how the process of applying Laicite in the life of secularism in France has been.

Literature Review

Human Security

The concept of human security can be interpreted as a natural right that is owned by humans based on liberal assumptions related to an individual right. The concept of human security can also be interpreted as a human value, which sees that in an effort to create a human security, it can be done by strengthening international law which is related to efforts to protect against various threats that threaten civilians and other groups during the ongoing conflict.

Based on the Report of the Commission on Human Security, human security has the meaning of protecting basic human values in order to achieve a sense of freedom and be able to fulfill their needs. Protecting basic human values means eliminating an acute, global threat, so in this case it is necessary to build the strengths and capabilities of the individual human beings themselves.

This concept of human security guarantees the achievement of a sense of freedom from want and freedom for fear. Where it means placing humans as the central source of the security constellation itself regarding threats, actors and efforts to achieve a sense of security itself (Tadjbakhsh and Chenoy, 2007: 13). In addition, the concept of human security places humans as the main actors who are important. That humans or individuals are not only used as objects that must be protected, but also become a subject that creates security for themselves and for other humans.

In this concept of human security also has a threat that is physical (tangible) and non-physical (intangible) such as lack of income, difficulty in accessing health facilities and services, unemployment, difficulty in

accessing education, to subjective ones such as humiliation, fear of crime and violence. These threats, both those that arise directly to individuals and indirectly, are carried out structurally. So in this case, the concept of human security consists of various types of threats that are broader in nature than those of a military nature (Rachmat. 2015: 261).

The concept of human security in this case is not only about the end of a war or violence, but also as a condition in which humans can live in peace without feeling fear about various things related to aspects of the necessities of life, both materially and psychologically. By placing individuals as the main source in achieving security, human security assumes that the safety of individuals is the key to creating global security, when individuals are threatened, global security will be threatened as well (Hampson et., al, 2002: 232).

The use of this concept aims to explain the existence of radical Islamism groups that exist in the midst of the implementation of Laicite's life in France which causes acts of terror that threaten the safety of French citizens.

Constructivism

Constructivism can be defined as a generative learning, namely an action that will then create a meaning from what has been learned. Constructivism itself is not a new idea, this understanding has existed and has been used for a long time. This understanding encourages individuals to find a motive for their previous actions, this causes an individual to have knowledge and become more dynamic. The constructivism approach itself also consists of various general concepts including:

- Individuals actively develop knowledge based on existing experience.

- In the learning process, individuals are expected to develop knowledge independently.

- The process of mutual influence between previous understanding and new understanding will appear in the learning process, and many others

The notion of constructivism has been explained by several experts in general. Constructivism according to Karli and Margaretha (2002: 16) is a learning process that begins with a cognitive conflict, which then becomes an asset for the development of knowledge possessed by an individual.

Meanwhile, Tobin and Timmons (Isjoni, 2007: 22) emphasize that all forms of learning based on constructivism must be careful about 4 values, namely:

- Has a connection with prior knowledge.

- Develop based on experience.

- Involves social interaction.

- There is an acceptable understanding.

On the other hand, Samsul Hardi (2010) states that constructivism is an effort to build a modern cultured social order. He assumes that constructivism is a philosophy of contextual learning, in the sense that knowledge is the result of previous understandings that have been arranged to be more dynamic.

Reflecting through history, constructivism has existed for a long time and involves constructivist figures including John Dewey, he conveys his view that schools must reflect the situation and conditions of the larger society and the classroom is a laboratory for individuals to learn how to solve problems in real life. Dewey encourages learning that involves problem solving oriented projects or tasks.

Followed by the views of Piaget and Vygotsky Constructivism. Piaget assumed that problem-based learning was developed on the cognitive constructivist view (Ibrahim and Nur, 2004). This understanding is based on various theories of Piaget. He emphasized that learning at all ages is actively involved in the process of

acquiring information and building knowledge independently. For him, knowledge is a construction of individual actions (Suparno, 1997). He believed that knowledge was not static. Vygotsky also thinks similarly, he believes that intellectual development occurs when individuals are faced with a new experience that has never been encountered before, when individuals try to solve existing problems, a new view of knowledge emerges (Ibrahim & Nur, 2004). Vygotsky believed that in order to gain security, individuals would learn new knowledge based on their prior knowledge. Piaget has an understanding that the stage of individual intellectual development through a process that is not bound by the social and cultural background of the individual, but Vygotsky looks more into the social aspects of his learning, he assumes that social interactions with other people can also affect the formation of new knowledge.

Then another constructivist figure, is Jerome Brunner, a psychologist. Jerome considered that discovery learning corresponds to the active search for knowledge by the individual and will naturally lead to more efficient results. He also suggested that the learning process should be through active participation by using concepts and principles so that they are encouraged to acquire knowledge.

Through the explanation above, we can see from a broader perspective what is happening in France at the moment. The concept of secularism in France was born from the collapse of a government that was bound by supernatural elements in the past. This is the paradigm of constructivism in France, this paradigm that gave birth to the understanding of Laicite secularism. The trauma of acts of terrorism in the past which is often bound by a government that relies on supernatural elements makes French society skeptical of all activities related to religion. This started only with the restriction of religious activities that could only be carried out in private, but developed into a disorganized manner, resulting in discrimination and wild stigma of terrorism being carried out by religious people.

Methods

The method used in this study is a descriptive method with a qualitative approach, in which the writing team describes from both a theoretical and practical point of view the influence of Laicite in the lives of French citizens. Then proceed with data interpretation so that it can explain and analyze problems and provide answers on how effective the application of the Laicite concept in France is in preventing radicalization from occurring. Then, the data analysis technique used explains the systematic data collection to make it easier for the writing team to draw conclusions. As well as data collection techniques in this writing, namely, using library research (library research). This technique allows the writing team to search for and be able to browse information from books, literature, research journals, as well as from news websites relating to issues related to the issues discussed in this study.

Findings

The Problem of the Concept of Laicite by Separatist Groups in France

Basically, the concept of secularism in France begins with the aim of separating the existence of religion from state government affairs to minimize conflicts. In addition, secularism in France also aims to avoid and minimize as much as possible the issue of separatism originating from various religious groups in the country. State secularism or Laicite in France occupies a central position in the country's national identity. In this case, secularism is inseparable from the spirit of the post-revolutionary France, namely in the statement "Liberty, Equality and Fraternity". All nuances in French life changed with the concept of full activity with freedom from all religions in order to provide free space for each community to move without giving gaps of weakness in interacting with each other while in France.

In 1905, in France, a law was issued as a form of protection for the concept of secularism which focused on the freedom of citizens to practice religion but also focused on preventing the entry of religious interests into state institutions or institutions. However, the impact since the existence of the Law with the Laicite concept comes new sources of problems, many of which come from the clash of civilizations on religious, cultural, racial and other identities, known as Clash Of Civilization. This is as marked, with the term freedom

in France which means expressing oneself in any form, including the phenomenon of the emergence of the satirical magazine Charlie Hebdo which publishes various forms of cartoon caricatures of the Prophet Muhammad and Jesus. However, under French law it is permissible to criticize or give any form of expression to 'religion', but not to insult someone based on their religion.

From something as simple as this, more and more cases have emerged such as radical movements in the name of certain religious groups such as Islamism as a form of resistance to the concept of secularism in France which is considered too excessive by allowing the media to express the form of God from various religious groups. Thus, many cases of terror and forms of resistance, including the death of Samuel Paty, which recently occurred in 2020. However, in his speech President Macron once stated that "Secularism is the foundation of the French state", and the thing that must be addressed here is "Separatism in Islam must be dealt with".

France itself is a country that strictly adheres to hate speech laws and Muslims are the largest minority group in the country. France is also known as a country that adheres to elements of secularism (Laicite) which is stated in the 1905 Secularism Law which has the main value of separating state affairs from religion. As time goes by, the law has been questioned by a group of communities in the country, because it has never been updated regarding the provision of punishment to anyone who violates the application of Laicite, only limited to revocation of citizenship and repatriation to the country of origin of the offender.

Plus, Laicite itself has seven meanings that have an influence that leads to the emergence of various kinds of opposition to the emergence of radical Islamic movements to implement their teachings. The seven meanings of Laicite are as follows:

- First, anti-religion or anything related to religion should not be related to the state government.

- Second, secularism or separating religious and state affairs, taking the case of separating France from the attachments of the Roman Catholic church in the past, thus making religion under the control of the state. hijab in his country, which has made radical Islamist groups more aggressive in prosecuting the application of Laicite some time ago, a history teacher at a French school was killed, his head was beheaded by a Muslim citizen from Russia because Samuel presented the satirical magazine Charlie Hebdo as part of his freedom. expression (Laicite).

- Then the third is individual or the state does not regulate the citizens in their country to follow what religion.

- Fourth, there is no assistance from the state for religious affairs.

- Fifth, even though it is secular in nature, it is still open by taking into account the existence of mass and middle groups among French citizens, therefore religious representative bodies are formed to mediate between the state and their respective adherents separately from state representative bodies.

- Sixth, acknowledging the existence of religion which is closed to the state environment, and lastly.

- Seventh, belonging to the extreme right-left wing seen from French culture.

However, Laicite has been in the spotlight again since the re-publishing of the satirical magazine Charlie Hebdo by Samuel Paty who was then beheaded by immigrants from Russia coupled with President Emmanuel Macron's speech which was in the spotlight because he considered Islam as part of Samuel Paty's beheading as a religion. which is critical. Therefore, it gave rise to other radical Islamist groups who carried out further acts of terror that threatened the security of French citizens. In fact, if the application is violated, as happened in the case of Samuel Paty some time ago, religious groups acting in the name of Islam are responsible for applying the values of radical Islamism.

The Process of Applying Laicite in the Life of Secularism in France

The application of Laicite in religious life in France began with the issuance of the 1905 Law which was part of the process of implementing the idea of separation of the state and church which began since the French Revolution in 1789 (Bruley, 2005). Although the implementation of Laicite did not run smoothly at first and again received opposition from religious groups in France some time ago which had threatened the sense of security of citizens, due to the implementation of Laicite, France was liberated from the religious wars a few years ago which took many lives and resulted in poor conditions. the French state became unstable, it was difficult to build diplomatic relations or cooperation with other countries.

As for the application of Laicite in religious life in France, which made the French state known to warmly accept immigrants or groups from other countries in search of a life, before starting to be controlled by radical extremist groups under the guise of fighting for the truth values of a religion, namely, based on Article First Act 1905, the French state guarantees the freedom of its citizens to choose the faith they want to profess. In addition, the expression of a religious value from each French citizen is guaranteed to be free, but still pays attention to the regulations that have been made by the state government because religion is below the state level. Therefore, France does not subsidize religious activities within the country.

The positive side of the application of Laicite in religious life in France fosters the openness of the French state itself to be able to carry out cooperative relations with other countries and easily build communication between groups of citizens of its country, regardless of the religious or personal side of each individual and prioritize the sense of belonging. togetherness, friendship and peace. So, although the state does not spend money from the French government budget for religious activities, the French state is not hostile to religious groups in it and continues to try to be a communication bridge between religious groups.

In addition, in view of radical groups such as Islamophobia in their country who often try to propagate the current situation in France with their acts of terror, for example in 2015 there were racial slurs from certain groups in the name of radicalism, the French state immediately protected the Islamic community. at that time with as many as 1000 of the 2500 mosques protected and enforced by law enforcement (Ambafrance, 2020).

The French government has also since three years ago established the Foundation de I'Islam de France which has the aim of accelerating the integration of migrants with Islam into French society or official citizens. The French government does not necessarily treat Islamic groups as minorities. With the presence of the Foundation de I'Islam de France, it is a reminder that Islam and terrorism in France cannot be united, if a terror group appears in France carrying Islamic values, it needs to be questioned further because it is part of radicalism. The organization is also a bridge to fight radical Islam in France, whose actions often disturb the security of French citizens themselves (Sudiaman 2017). So, with the application of Laicite, it is also easier for the French state to carry out knowledge sharing activities about religious knowledge with each other openly.

Then furthermore, the application of Laicite in school life in France itself has advantages, where students there, especially girls who are more protected, should not be discriminated against. In fact, until now the French state still respects the existence of Islam which did not close their life activities at the beginning of last January which could have been dissolved by certain parties due to the Samuel Paty incident and several other acts of terror. Therefore, all schools or places of study in France are all uniform and do not have differences from one another which may even lead to gaps between groups, because schools in France follow rules that were late made by the state.

Conclusion

In discussing the scientific journal entitled "Effectiveness of the Application of Laicite in the Life of Secularism in France to Minimize Religious Radicalization Groups", this author finally succeeded in proving that the existence of the concept of Laicite in France was aimed at separating religious affairs and government affairs. This is done with the aim of avoiding the emergence of prolonged conflicts due to the involvement of certain elements of religious, cultural and racial identity.

So, in the discussion, the writing of this scientific journal explains the history that is the background of the presence of the concept of secularism in France comprehensively. Starting from his reign which was still a monarchy with a king's level of authority with a certain lineage, it became a big problem when accompanied by a war between religions between Catholic Christians and Protestant Christians which claimed many lives. However, in the end, when the revolutionary period in France had occurred with the renewal of the Renaissance era, everything became better. With the addition of the stipulation of the Laicite Act of 1905 which played a role in making the concept of secularism fully formed and ratified in the French state. Thus, since that time all affairs in the life and institutions of the French state government were officially separated from religious affairs.

References

Aljazeera. (2020, Oktober, 30). "Tens of thousands of Muslims protest France's 'Islamophobia'.". *Aljazeera.* Diakses dari https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2020/10/30/as-anger-risesthousands-of- muslims-protest-french-cartoons.

Ambafrance. (2020, Desember, 20). "Praktik Keagamaan di Perancis: Islam." *Ambafrance.* Diakses dari https://id.ambafrance.org/Praktik-Keagamaan-di-Perancis-Islam. BBC. (2020, Oktober, 25). "France recalls Turkey envoy after Erdogan says Macron needs 'mental check'." *BBC News.* Diakses dari https://www.bbc.com/news/world- europe-54678826.

BBC Indonesia. (2020, Oktober, 31). "Sekularisme Prancis: Karikatur Nabi Muhammad, 'Separatisme Islam', Sikap Presiden Macron dan Tiga Serangan Teror dalam Sebulan." *BC Indonesia.* Diakses dari https://www.bbc.com/indonesia/dunia-54630462.

Bruley, De Yves. (2005). *Histoire De La Laïcité à la Françaisa, Vygotsky, Lev (1978). Mind in Society. London: Harvard University Press.*

Christmas, Sandy Kurnia dan Purwantim Evi. (2020). Perkembangan Sistem Pemerintahan dan Konsep Kedaulatan Pasca Revolusi Terhadap Hukum Internasional. *Jurnal Pembagunan Hukum Indonesia.* 2(2).

Debre, Isabel. (2020, Oktober, 31). "As anger rises, Muslims protest French cartoons. Associated Press." *AP News.* Diakses dari https://apnews.com/article/pakistan-dubai-boycotts-united-arab-emirates-emmanuel-macron-d99c9ef807297c31d9dff5e81b4c1d3d.

DeVries, R. (1997). *Piaget's social theory. Educational Researcher.*

Hampson, Fen Osler et., al. (2002). *Madness in the Multitude: Human Security and World Disorder.* Ontario: Oxford University Press

France 24. (2020, Oktober, 27). "France encourages EU allies to take measures against Turkey after Erdogan's boycott calls." *France 24.* Diakses dari https://www.france24.com/en/france/20201027-france-encourages-eu-allies-to-take-measures-against-turkey-after-erdogan-s-boycott-calls.Guenfoud, Ibtissem. (2020, Oktober, 28). "Muslim nations call for boycott of French products." *ABC News,* Diakses dari https://abcnews.go.com/International/muslim-nations-call-boycott frenchproducts/story?id=73858014.

Kumparan. (2018, Juli, 8). "Perubahan Situasi dan Sistem Pemerintahan Prancis Setelah Revolusi." *Kumparan.* Diakses dari https://kumparan.com/potongan- nostalgia/perubahan-situasi-dan-sistem-pemerintahan-prancis-setelah-revolusi-21dM5TZM1h/full.

Kumparan. (2018, Juni, 22). "Periode Renaissance, Kebangkitan Peradaban Modern Eropa." *Kumparan.* Diakses dari https://kumparan.com/potongan-nostalgia/periode- renaissance-membangkitkan-peradaban-modern-eropa/full.

Mudzakkir, Amin. (2013). Sekularisme dan Identitas Muslim Eropa. *Jurnal Kajian Wilayah.* 4(1).

Nugraheny, Dian Erika. (2020, Oktober, 31). "Jokowi Kecam Pernyataan Presiden Perancis yang Dinilai Hina Islam." *Kompas.* Diakses dari https://nasional.kompas.com/read/2020/10/31/14553841/jokowi-kecam-pernyataan-presiden-perancis-yang-dinilai-hina-islam?page=all.

Rachmat, Angga Nurdin. (2015). *Keamanan Global: Transformasi Isu Keamanan Pasca Perang Dingin.* Bandung: Penerbit Alfabeta.

Rahman, Waliur. (2020, Oktober, 27). "Huge Bangladesh rally calls for boycott of French products." *BBC News*. Diakses dari https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-   54704859.

Republika.co.id. (2020, November, 3). "Awal Sekularisme dan Mengapa Bisa Muncul Gerakan di Prancis". *Republika.co.id*. Diakses dari https://republika.co.id/berita/qj75cs459/akar-sekularisme-dan-mengapa-bisa-muncul-gesekan-di-prancis.Sandford, Alasdair. (2020, Oktober, 27). "Macron and Islam: What has the French president actually said to outrage the Muslim world?." *Euro News*. Diakses dari https://www.euronews.com/2020/10/27/macron-and-islam-what-has-the-french-president-actually-said-to-outrage-the-muslim-world.

Setiawan, Andri. (2020, November, 7). "Sejarah Laicite, Dasar Falsafah Sekularisme Prancis." *Historia*. Diakses dari https://historia.id/politik/articles/sejarah-laicite-dasar-falsafah-sekularisme-prancis-PMKKX.

Sicca, Shintaloka Pradita. (2020, Desember, 10). "Presiden Macron Galang Dukungan Kabinet untuk RUU"Anti- Separatisme Perancis." *Kompas*. Diakses dari https://www.google.com/amp/s/amp.kompas.com/global/read/2020/12/10/07414877 0/presiden-macron-galang-dukungan-kabinet-untuk-ruu-anti-separatime.

Sudiaman, Maman. (2020, April, 27). "Ultra-Kanan, *Laicite,* Islam Prancis." *Republika.co.id*.   Diakses dari https://www.google.com/amp/s/m.republika.co.id/amp/op0uy7319.

Sutisna, Yaya. (2013). *Penerapan Pendekatan Konstruktivisme*. Bandung: Universitas Pendidikan   Indonesia.

Syahla, Aulia Salsabil. (2020, Oktober, 27). "Kumpulkan Pemuka Agama, Presiden Jokowi Juga Kecam Aksi Kekerasan di Paris dan Nice." *Pikiran Rakyat*. Diakses dari https://isubogor.pikiranrakyat.com/warta/pr45893547/kumpulkan-pemuka-   agama-presiden-jokowi-juga-kecam-aksi-kekerasan-di-paris-dan-nice.

Tadjbakhsh, Shahrbanou dan Chenoy, Anuradia M. (2007). *Human Security: Concept and   Implications*. London: Routledge.

The Guardian. (2020, Oktober, 31). "Mahathir Mohamad says his remarks after French attack were taken out of context." *The Guardian*. Diakses dari https://www.theguardian.com/politics/2020/oct/31/mahathir-mohamad-says-   his-remarks-after-french-attack-were-taken-out-of-context.

Theys. Sarina. (2018). *Introducing Constructivism in International Relations Theory. E-International   Relations*.

Tirta, Tyson. (2019, Juli, 14). "Sejarah Revolusi Perancis Bermula dari Penyerbuan Penjara   Bastille." *Tirto.id*. Diakses dari https://tirto.id/sejarah-revolusi-perancis-bermula-   dari-penyerbuan-penjara-bastille-cN53.

Trtworld. (2020, Oktober, 27). "Anti-Semitism is unacceptable in France, why not   Islamophobia?" *TRT World*. Diakses dari https://www.trtworld.com/magazine/anti-semitism-is-unacceptable-in-france- why-not-islamophobia-40954.

Vygotsky, Lev (1978). *Mind in Society*. London: Harvard University Press.

Welianto, Ari. (2020, Mei, 27). "Penyebab Terjadinya Revolusi Perancis." *Kompas*. Diakses   dari https://www.kompas.com/skola/read/2020/05/27/160000869/penyebab-terjadinya-revolusi-perancis?page=al.